



## KMI Panel Outcomes – 19 & 20 October 2024

Match Round	Home Team	Away Team	Incident / On-field Decision	Minute	Referee or Assistant	Difficulty	On-field decision outcome	Votes (Correct: Incorrect)	VAR overturn (Y/N)	VAR intervention outcome	Votes (Correct: Incorrect)	Notes
MR8	Celtic	Aberdeen	Potential red card for A10 challenge on C11 - caution given	38	Referee	1	Correct	5:0	N	Correct	5:0	The on-field decision was unanimously supported.
MR8	Celtic	Aberdeen	Goal scored by A11 - goal given - potential handball	69	Referee	4	Incorrect - No Handball	0:5	Y	Correct - Handball	5:0	The panel discussed this decision at length with the panel unanimously agreeing that VAR was correct to intervene and disallow the goal as the ball had struck the Aberdeen attacker's arm leading directly to a goal. The panel highlighted this was a very difficult decision to make in real time. They believe this is exactly why VAR has been introduced to overturn these really tight decisions that are difficult to detect onfield.
MR8	Celtic	Aberdeen	Goal scored by C9 - foul given for C2 challenge on A1	90+3	Referee	1	Correct	5:0	N	Correct	5:0	The on-field decision was unanimously supported.
MR8	Celtic	Aberdeen	Possible penalty for A11 potential handball - penalty not awarded	90+12	Referee	3	Correct	5:0	N	Correct	5:0	The on-field decision was unanimously supported. The panel highlighted that the Referee was in a credible position to make the call and that the Aberdeen defender did not use his arm to block the shot.
MR8	Celtic	Aberdeen	Possible penalty for A33 challenge on C14 - freekick awarded	90+9	Referee	3	Correct	5:0	N	Correct	5:0	The panel unanimously deemed the on-field decision correct, noting that the Referee was in a credible position to make the correct call.
MR8	St. Johnstone	Ross County	Goal scored by St.J29 - goal given - potential foul by St.J16 on RC3	15	Referee	1	Correct	3:2	N	Correct	3:2	The panel discussed this decision at length with the majority (3:2) deeming the onfield decision correct. They believed that there wasn't a foul in the build up to the goal and therefore the goal was correctly awarded. Two panelists believed that there was a foul in the build up and that VAR should have intervened and disallowed the goal.
MR8	St. Johnstone	Ross County	Goal scored by St.J10 - goal given - potential offside	67	Assistant Referee	4	Incorrect - Onside	0:5	Y	Correct - Factual Offside	5:0	The panel deemed the on-field decision as incorrect and supported the VAR's decision to intervene and disallow the goal for offside. They noted that this was a very tight decision and is another example of why VAR was introduced.
MR8	St. Johnstone	Ross County	Potential red card for RC21 challenge on St.J23 - red given	77	Referee	2	Correct	4:1	N	Correct	5:0	The panel discussed this decision at length with the majority (4:1) deeming the onfield decision correct. They believed that the tackle endangered the safety of the opponent and a red card was correct for serious foul play. One panelist believed that the tackle was borderline and the player should have received a caution. However, the panelist also believed this was not a clear and obvious error and did not expect VAR to intervene and overturn the red card.
MR8	Dundee United	Hibernian	Goal scored by DU19 - goal given - potential offside DU19	24	Assistant Referee	2	Correct - Offside	5:0	N	Correct - Factual Offside	5:0	The on-field decision was unanimously supported.
MR8	Dundee United	Hibernian	Goal scored by DU19 - goal given - potential offside DU19	58	Assistant Referee	2	Incorrect - Onside	0:5	Y	Correct - Factual Offside	5:0	The panel deemed the on-field decision as incorrect and supported the VAR's decision to intervene and disallow the goal for offside.
MR8	Dundee United	Hibernian	Potential red card for H11 challenge on DU17 - second caution given	85	Referee	2	Incorrect - Not Serious Foul Play	0:5	N	Incorrect - Serious Foul Play	0:5	The panel deemed the on-field decision as incorrect and believed VAR should have intervened to upgrade the second caution to a straight red card for serious foul play. The overall expectation was that this decision should have been identified by the on-field match officials.
MR8	Kilmarnock	Rangers	Possible penalty for K6 potential handball - penalty not awarded	26	Referee	1	Correct	5:0	N	Correct	5:0	The on-field decision was unanimously supported.
MR8	Kilmarnock	Rangers	Goal scored by K6 - offside given	29	Assistant Referee	3	Correct	5:0	N	Correct	5:0	The on-field offside decision was unanimously supported. The panel highlighted that the Assistant Referee was in a credible position to make the correct call in what was a very tight decision.

### Difficulty Levels

1. A simple decision that all officials should get correct.
2. A fairly simple decision for a select group official, though with more factors to consider.
3. A more complex decision with a greater degree of subjectivity and/or more factors to consider, that a select group official should nonetheless call correctly.
4. A difficult decision for officials with a high degree of subjectivity or challenging considerations to identify. One that needs deliberation. A 50/50 call.
5. A particularly tough decision that all referees would struggle with. The type of judgement where technology is needed to support officials.